

72. Evaluate biblically Karlstadt’s argument that “this” (τοῦτο) cannot refer to “bread” because in Greek, the word “this” is neuter (like “body,” σῶμα), but “bread” (ἄρτος) is masculine.



73. Evaluate this more liberal argument: Jesus spoke Aramaic, not Greek, that night, so we can’t really recover what Jesus said that night.



73. Evaluate biblically this even more liberal argument: “One cannot arrive at historical certainty about Jesus’ last meal in general and in particular the words spoken there, least of all about the so-called command of repetition. Therefore a dogmatic teaching concerning the Supper can no longer proceed without further ado from an institution of the Supper by Jesus on the night he was betrayed” (Ulrich Kühn, 1977— from a scholarly German encyclopedia article about the Lord’s Supper).



74. Evaluate biblically this more conservative and logical argument: (Grudem, *Systematic Theology*, p. 996) “As he was sitting with his disciples holding the bread, the bread was in his hand but it was distinct from his body, and that was, of course, evident to his disciples. None of the disciples present would have thought that the loaf of bread that Jesus held in his hand was actually his physical body, for they could see his body before their eyes.”



75. Evaluate biblically this similar argument: “You are teaching that people chew, swallow, process and eliminate Jesus’ body.”



76. Evaluate biblically the argument that Jesus used metaphors at times, such as “I am the vine,” so here he certainly was using a metaphor, too. (For help, Martin Luther [*What Luther Says*, 2487] once suggested comparing Jesus’ words of institution with the end of Exodus 12:11.)



77. Fill in the Luther’s blanks: “When Christ says, ‘I am the true Vine’ (John 15:1), he is speaking of the _____ *spiritual* _____. He really *was* this vine and did not merely _____ it. How would it sound to say: I symbolize the true vine?”



8. In a similar vein, doesn’t Matthew 11:14 prove, or at least suggest, that the sacrament is strictly symbolic?



79. What about 1 Corinthians 11:26? Doesn’t it prove that the sacrament is strictly symbolic?



80. If Christ had meant to give us a symbolic meal, which element of the Passover meal would have made more sense to symbolize him, than the unleavened bread?



81. Someone remains unconvinced. He or she says, “But . . . but there is no way Jesus’ physical body can be in millions of mouths at the same time,” or the like. Respond biblically. (Start in Genesis 1:1☺!)



82. Along similar lines, evaluate Luther’s two following illustrations biblically:

- a. “A preacher stands and preaches. His voice is a single voice. It proceeds from his mouth, it is formed in his mouth, and it is in his mouth. But the same single voice, which is at one particular place, viz. in his mouth, passes in an instant into four, five, or ten thousand ears. And yet there is no other voice in those many thousand ears than the voice in the preacher’s mouth, and it is at the same time, at the same instant, a single voice in the preacher’s mouth and in all the people’s ears, just as if his mouth and their ears were one point where his voice was located without any intervening space.

“My friend, if God can do this with a physical voice, why should he not be able to do it far more easily with the body of Christ, even if it were at a particular place, as they say, and yet at the same time be truly in the bread and wine at many places, as it were in two ears? For his body is much quicker and lighter than any voice, and all creation is more permeable to him than the air is to the voice, as he proved in the ease of the gravestone, inasmuch as no voice can pass through a stone as easily as Christ’s body does”(AE 37:225).

- b. “Again I must give a simple comparison. You see the sun shining in a large lake or pond. Naturally there can be no more than one image of the sun in the water, since there is only one sun. How does it happen, then, that if a hundred or two hundred people stand around the lake, each one will have the image of the sun before him at his own vantage point, and no one at another’s? And if one walks along the lake, the image of the sun goes with him everywhere he goes. If a thousand eyes look into the water, each one will see the image directly in front of himself and not before someone else. Well, the sun is a created thing, and in a certain way can be in the lake at all points. My friend, who will bid us deny that God can far more readily know and find a way by which Christ’s one body may be present according to his will, everywhere or wherever he wishes?” (AE 37:277).



83. “But . . . but,” someone still objects. “Christ’s body can’t be in the bread. There’s no room. It can’t be in the wine. It can’t be measured or detected in any way.” Respond biblically.



84. What do you think of Luther’s response to this sort of objection? Why?

“To use some crude illustrations, my vision passes through and exists in air, light, or water and does not occupy or yield any space; a sound or tone passes through and exists in air or water or a board and a wall and neither occupies nor yields space; likewise light and heat go through and exist in air, water, glass, or crystals and the like, but without occupying or yielding space, and many more like these. He employed this mode of presence when he left the closed grave and came through closed doors” (AE 37:222).



85. What about the person who throws his hands up and says that whatever a person believes about Christ’s presence in the sacrament doesn’t really matter? What does Jesus say in John 3:12?

